



EVALUATION TABULATION

RFQ No. RFQ 24-PR-4

New Boat Ramp and Amenities Design, Engineering, Permitting and CEI Services

RESPONSE DEADLINE: April 23, 2024 at 10:00 am

Tuesday, May 14, 2024

PHASE 1

AGGREGATE SCORES SUMMARY

Vendor	Samantha Bergeron	James Buresh	Randy Coslow	Total Score (Max Score 100)
Dredging & Marine Consultants, LLC	100	95	85	93.33
Halff Associates, Inc.	90	97	93	93.33
CPH, LLC.	93	94	85	90.67
Zev Cohen & Associates, Inc.	96	95	80	90.33
Construct Co, Inc.	89	82	40	70.33

EVALUATION CRITERIA

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Project Understanding, Methodology and Approach	Points Based	50 (50% of Total)

Description:

- Support needed from City staff to execute services
- Demonstrated Experience working on similar projects with minimal claims, disputes and / or litigation
- Project management and Quality Control Procedures
- Processes and Procedures for meeting schedules and budgets

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFQ No. RFQ 24-PR-4

New Boat Ramp and Amenities Design, Engineering, Permitting and CEI Services

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Availability and Management Capacity	Points Based	20 (20% of Total)

Description:

Written documentation to substantiate availability and responsiveness. Current project / work for each key team member.

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
Qualifications and Relevant Experience	Points Based	20 (20% of Total)

Description:

- Experience providing similar services for similar projects. Evaluation of listed projects.
- Qualifications of Key Team Members.
- Written Description of collaborations, project outcomes and mitigated issues

Criteria	Scoring Method	Weight (Points)
References	Points Based	10 (10% of Total)

Description:

List of all municipal projects the firm carried out in the last three (3) years.

EVALUATORS

Name	Title
Samantha Bergeron	Director of Parks and Recreation
James Buresh	Finance Accountant
Randy Coslow	City Engineer / Director of Environmental Services

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFQ No. RFQ 24-PR-4

New Boat Ramp and Amenities Design, Engineering, Permitting and CEI Services

VENDOR SCORES BY EVALUATION CRITERIA

Vendor	Project Understanding, Methodology and Approach Points Based 50 Points (50%)	Availability and Management Capacity Points Based 20 Points (20%)	Qualifications and Relevant Experience Points Based 20 Points (20%)	References Points Based 10 Points (10%)
Dredging & Marine Consultants, LLC	47.3	18.3	18.3	9.3
Halff Associates, Inc.	47.3	19.3	18.3	8.3
CPH, LLC.	45	18	18.7	9
Zev Cohen & Associates, Inc.	45.3	17.7	18	9.3
Construct Co, Inc.	38	12.7	12.3	7.3

Vendor	Total Score (Max Score 100)
Dredging & Marine Consultants, LLC	93.33
Halff Associates, Inc.	93.33
CPH, LLC.	90.67
Zev Cohen & Associates, Inc.	90.33
Construct Co, Inc.	70.33

INDIVIDUAL PROPOSAL SCORES

Construct Co, Inc.

Project Understanding, Methodology and Approach | Points Based | 50 Points (500%)

Samantha Bergeron: 46

Provided project examples of bridges, road work, tiebacks, soldier beams.

James Buresh: 43

Straightforward methodology and approach.

Randy Coslow: 25

Built parks, but no park design experience.

Availability and Management Capacity | Points Based | 20 Points (200%)

Samantha Bergeron: 17

did not provide availabilty of each key team member

James Buresh: 16

Current workloads difficult to locate.

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFQ No. RFQ 24-PR-4

New Boat Ramp and Amenities Design, Engineering, Permitting and CEI Services

Randy Coslow: 5

Insufficient documentation of design team availability to complete the project.

Qualifications and Relevant Experience | Points Based | 20 Points (200%)

Samantha Bergeron: 16

looking specifically for experience for the design and permitting of boat ramp on Class II waterway near a sensitive waterway like Indian River Lagoon area

James Buresh: 16

Lacks qualifications of some competitors.

Randy Coslow: 5

Qualified for construction. Engineering design is limited to structural aspects of seawalls and foundations.

References | Points Based | 10 Points (100%)

Samantha Bergeron: 10

Great list of references

James Buresh: 7

Some similar references, but not all.

Randy Coslow: 5

Projects built, not designed.

CPH, LLC.

Project Understanding, Methodology and Approach | Points Based | 50 Points (500%)

Samantha Bergeron: 48

Provided examples of two boat ramp design projects Kingfish Boat Ramp and North Coquina Boat Ramp Improvements

James Buresh: 47

Emphasis on safety and cost control.

Randy Coslow: 40

Large team. Good comparable projects.

Availability and Management Capacity | Points Based | 20 Points (200%)

Samantha Bergeron: 19

provided availability of key team members

James Buresh: 20

There is sufficient availability.

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFQ No. RFQ 24-PR-4

New Boat Ramp and Amenities Design, Engineering, Permitting and CEI Services

Randy Coslow: 15

Good availability. Many persons involved.

Qualifications and Relevant Experience | Points Based | 20 Points (200%)

Samantha Bergeron: 18

Provided examples of two boat ramp design projects Kingfish Boat Ramp and North Coquina Boat Ramp Improvements

James Buresh: 18

Only mentioned one boat ramp project.

Randy Coslow: 20

All professional specialties represented.

References | Points Based | 10 Points (100%)

Samantha Bergeron: 8

Great list of references. Looking for more boat ramp design and permitting project experience.

James Buresh: 9

Many similar projects in size/scope.

Randy Coslow: 10

Other boat ramps in use.

Dredging & Marine Consultants, LLC

Project Understanding, Methodology and Approach | Points Based | 50 Points (500%)

Samantha Bergeron: 50

provided comprehensive understanding of the project, location and site history. Provided comparable considerations for amenities and use for the design.

James Buresh: 47

Emphasis on speed and cost.

Randy Coslow: 45

Similar projects completed.

Availability and Management Capacity | Points Based | 20 Points (200%)

Samantha Bergeron: 20

Provided key team member availability

James Buresh: 20

There is sufficient availability.

Randy Coslow: 15

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFQ No. RFQ 24-PR-4

New Boat Ramp and Amenities Design, Engineering, Permitting and CEI Services

Reasonable number of subconsultants.

Qualifications and Relevant Experience | Points Based | 20 Points (200%)

Samantha Bergeron: 20

Provided Boat Ramp Design and Permitting experience in this vicinity surrounding Class II waters near environmentally sensitive areas like the Indian River Lagoon area; George Kenney Memorial Park, Lemon Bluff, Fishermans Wharf Boat Ramp, North Causeway, Sunrise Park, Hickory Point Boat Ramp, Waterfront Park, Cassen Park, Swoope Site Public Boat Launch Facility

James Buresh: 20

Qualified staff and many similar projects.

Randy Coslow: 15

Some key staff have very good depth of experience.

References | Points Based | 10 Points (100%)

Samantha Bergeron: 10

Provided excellent reference list with Boat Ramp projects

James Buresh: 8

Similar projects referenced.

Randy Coslow: 10

Good list of comparable projects

Halff Associates, Inc.

Project Understanding, Methodology and Approach | Points Based | 50 Points (500%)

Samantha Bergeron: 47

Looking for firms with specific boat ramp design and permitting experience near environmentally sensitive areas similar to the Indian River Lagoon. The challenges page with solutions was impressive. One of the Environmental Permitting agencies will include St. John's Water Management District, not Southwest Florida Water Management District.

James Buresh: 50

Exemplary technical understanding of project.

Randy Coslow: 45

Wide breadth of comparable projects

Availability and Management Capacity | Points Based | 20 Points (200%)

Samantha Bergeron: 18

provided availability key team members

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFQ No. RFQ 24-PR-4

New Boat Ramp and Amenities Design, Engineering, Permitting and CEI Services

James Buresh: 20

There is sufficient availability.

Randy Coslow: 20

Good availability of key staff

Qualifications and Relevant Experience | Points Based | 20 Points (200%)

Samantha Bergeron: 17

Looking for firms with specific boat ramp design and permitting experience near environmentally sensitive areas similar to the Indian River Lagoon

James Buresh: 20

Qualified staff and many similar projects.

Randy Coslow: 18

Most of work by prime, good selection of subconsultants for specialized functions.

References | Points Based | 10 Points (100%)

Samantha Bergeron: 8

Great list of references, Boat ramp experience provided were located inland on lakes

James Buresh: 7

Not all referenced similar to referenced project.

Randy Coslow: 10

Nearby projects for comparisons.

Zev Cohen & Associates, Inc.

Project Understanding, Methodology and Approach | Points Based | 50 Points (500%)

Samantha Bergeron: 49

Provided examples with partner Coastal Tech who has or is currently working on projects that are boat ramps near environmentally sensitive waterways similar to the Indian River Lagoon, Oriole Beach Boat Ramp, Riverside Park Boat Ramp, POW/MIA Park, Port St. John Boat Ramp

James Buresh: 47

Strong approach, but did not expound on quality control.

Randy Coslow: 40

Good park design experience. Limited boat ramp design experience.

Availability and Management Capacity | Points Based | 20 Points (200%)

Samantha Bergeron: 18

provided availability of key team members

EVALUATION TABULATION

RFQ No. RFQ 24-PR-4

New Boat Ramp and Amenities Design, Engineering, Permitting and CEI Services

James Buresh: 20

There is sufficient availability.

Randy Coslow: 15

Some team members have somewhat limited availability.

Qualifications and Relevant Experience | Points Based | 20 Points (200%)

Samantha Bergeron: 19

Provided examples with partner Coastal Tech who has or is currently working on projects that are boat ramps near environmentally sensitive waterways similar to the Indian River Lagoon, Oriole Beach Boat Ramp, Riverside Park Boat Ramp, POW/MIA Park, Port St. John Boat Ramp

James Buresh: 20

Qualified staff and many similar projects.

Randy Coslow: 15

Good team, incl prime and subconsultants.

References | Points Based | 10 Points (100%)

Samantha Bergeron: 10

provided list of references with boat ramp design and permitting projects

James Buresh: 8

Many similar references.

Randy Coslow: 10

Good references.